

# **Exhibit 47**

**Transcript of the Testimony of  
Barbara Hines**

**Date:**

June 26, 2018

**Case:**

STATE OF TEXAS vs UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al., )

Plaintiffs, )

vs. )

CASE NO. 1:18:cv-00068

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, )

ET AL., )

Defendants, )

and  $\gamma = \frac{1}{2}$  and  $\gamma = \frac{1}{3}$  respectively. The results are shown in Figure 1. The results show that the error decreases as the number of points increases. The error is also smaller for  $\gamma = \frac{1}{2}$  than for  $\gamma = \frac{1}{3}$ .

KARLA PEREZ, et al., )

Defendant-Intervenors.)

ORAL VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION

BARBARA HINES

JUNE 26, 2018

ORAL VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF BARBARA HINES,  
produced as a witness at the instance of the PLAINTIFF  
STATES and duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and  
numbered cause on the 26th day of June, 2018, from  
10:04 a.m. to 12:41 p.m., before Dana Richardson,  
Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of  
Texas, reported by computerized stenotype machine at the  
Office of the Attorney General, 300 West 15th Street,  
Austin, Texas 78701, pursuant to the Federal Rules of  
Civil Procedure and the provisions stated on the record  
or attached hereto.

Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018  
Page 2

APPEARANCES

FOR PLAINTIFF STATES:

Mr. Todd Lawrence Disher and  
Mr. Trent Peroyea  
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL  
SPECIAL COUNSEL FOR CIVIL LITIGATION  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, Texas 78711-2548  
Telephone: (512) 463-2100  
Fax: (512) 936-0545  
E-mail: todd.disher@oag.texas.gov

FOR DEFENDANT UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

Mr. Daniel Hu - (via telephone)  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, CIVIL DIVISION  
OFFICE OF IMMIGRATION LITIGATION  
DISTRICT COURT SECTION  
P.O. Box 868  
Washington, D.c. 20044  
Telephone: (202) 616-1246  
E-mail: jeffrey.robins@usdoj.gov

FOR DEFENDANT INTERVENORS:

Ms. Nina Perales  
MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL FUND  
110 Broadway, Suite 300  
San Antonio, Texas 78205  
Telephone: (210) 224-5476  
Fax: (210) 224-5382  
E-mail: nperales@maldef.org

ALSO PRESENT:

Mr. Austin Kreitz, Summer Associate

Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018

Page 45

1 Q. Okay. Now, if I look at number -- okay. So if  
2 we look at the column that says "approved," there's a  
3 reference to Footnote No. 10 --

4 A. What's -- yeah.

5 Q. -- in Exhibit No. 3?

6 A. Okay. Exhibit No. 3. Yes.

7 Q. And Footnote No. 10 says, "The number of  
8 requests approved during the reporting period." What  
9 does that mean?

10 A. This is a government document.

11 Q. Do you know what that means?

12 A. The number of requests approved?

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. Yes. I assume that's the number of  
15 applications approved during the -- that quarter.

16 Q. Okay. And then Footnote 11 says -- which  
17 refers to the denied column, "The number of requests  
18 that were denied, terminated, or withdrawn during the  
19 reporting period."

20 What does that mean?

21 A. Number 11. Okay. And -- and, once again, you  
22 know, these -- these are aggregated between initial and  
23 renewals. It -- basically what it says, "Requests that  
24 were denied, terminated, or withdrawn."

25 Q. So what does it mean if a request was

Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018

Page 46

1 withdrawn?

2 A. That -- what does it mean when it's withdrawn?

3 It means that the person has not continued -- has made  
4 the decision not to pursue the application.

5 Q. All right. Of the numbers listed in the denied  
6 column, do you know how many of those -- let's just take  
7 the January to March initial number for fiscal year 2017  
8 which is 3,024.

9 A. I'm sorry. What --

10 Q. Take your time.

11 A. What column are you on?

12 Q. The denied column.

13 A. Uh-huh. On Exhibit 3?

14 Q. Yes.

15 A. Uh-huh. Okay.

16 Q. For Q2, January through March, initial. And  
17 that's in fiscal year 2017, right?

18 A. Uh-huh.

19 Q. I see a number that says 3,024. Do you see  
20 that?

21 A. January -- that's January to March renewals.

22 Q. Make sure we're all on the same page here.

23 A. The number that I -- yes. Right. 3,024,  
24 uh-huh.

25 THE WITNESS: Thank you. Just a second.

Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018

Page 47

1 MS. PERALES: I think we need to -- (sotto  
2 voce comments off the record with the witness.)

3 THE WITNESS: Okay. Yeah.

4 A. Okay. There it is. There's the 3024.

5 MS. PERALES: Uh-huh.

6 A. Okay. Yes, I see it.

7 Q. (BY MR. DISHER) Okay. So in fiscal year 2017,  
8 Quarter 2, January to March, initial DACA applications,  
9 for the number denied, it's listed at 3,024, right?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Okay. Out of that 3,024, do you know how many  
12 were withdrawn by the applicant?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Okay. Do you know what it means for a DACA  
15 request to be terminated?

16 A. No. Probably that would be in the renewal  
17 phase, that the status was not renewed and instead was  
18 terminated.

19 Q. Well, what do you base that on?

20 A. In order to -- I base it on what -- the rules  
21 of termination -- in order to terminate any immigration  
22 application, you would have to send notice to terminate.  
23 So some could have been terminated in the midst of a  
24 DACA application as well. I don't know, actually.

25 Q. Can you terminate an initial request for DACA

Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018

Page 48

1 status?

2 A. Yes, you can.

3 Q. Okay. So do you know how many -- of the 3,024  
4 number listed in the denied column for January to March,  
5 initial DACA applications for fiscal year 2017, do you  
6 know how many were terminated?

7 A. I do not.

8 Q. Okay. And so who would be the one who  
9 terminates an application for initial DACA status?

10 A. The agency.

11 Q. That would be USCIS?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And why would USCIS terminate an application?

14 A. It could terminate an application because of  
15 subsequently discovered criminal conduct, because the  
16 person departed from -- perhaps possibly left the  
17 country without proper documents.

18 Q. Okay. What -- what about if USCIS couldn't get  
19 in contact with the applicant, would that cause an  
20 application to be terminated by USCIS?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. All right. And, again, you don't know -- out  
23 of the 3,024 in the denied column, you don't know how  
24 many of those were terminated by USCIS?

25 A. No.



Barbara Hines

June 26, 2018

Page 95

1 STATE OF TEXAS  
2 COUNTY OF HARRIS

3 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

4 I, Dana Richardson, a Certified Shorthand Reporter  
5 in and for the State of Texas, do certify that this  
6 deposition transcript is a true record of the testimony  
7 given by the witness named herein, after said witness  
8 was duly sworn by me. The witness was requested to  
9 review the deposition.

10 I further certify that I am neither attorney or  
11 counsel for, related to, nor employed by any parties to  
12 the action in which this testimony is taken and,  
13 further, that I am not a relative or employee of any  
14 counsel employed by the parties hereto or financially  
15 interested in the action.

16 I further certify that the amount of time used by  
17 each party at the deposition is as follows:

18 Mr. Todd Lawrence Disher - 02:09

19 Mr. Daniel Hu - 00:01

20 SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO under my hand and seal of  
21 office on this the 27th day of June, 2018.

*Dana Richardson*

22 Dana Richardson, RPR, TX CSR 5386

23 Expiration: 12/31/19

24 Kim Tindall & Associates, LLC, Firm No. 631

25 16414 San Pedro, Suite 900

San Antonio, Texas 78232

Phone (210) 697-3400

Fax (210) 697-3408